Case 1:22-cv-06529-AT Document 38 Filed 02/03/

DOCUMENT
ELECTRONICALLY FILED
DOC #:
DATE FILED: 2/3/2023

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COFFOR THE SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF NEV

In re Insider, Inc. Pixel-VPPA Litigation

Case No. 1:22-cv-06529-AT

Judge: Hon. Analisa Torres

JOINT STIPULATION AND PROTECTIVE ORDER

Pursuant to Rule 26(c) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among plaintiffs Darmel Roby, Jennifer Juenke, Jamie Spritzer, and Timothy Stokes ("Plaintiffs") and defendant Insider, Inc. ("Defendant") (each a "Party," and collectively, the "Parties"), by and through their undersigned counsel, that the terms below shall apply in this case.

The Court having found that good cause exists for issuance of an appropriately tailored confidentiality order governing the pre-trial phase of this action, and the parties having stipulated to the following provisions, hereby ORDERS that any person subject to this ORDER, including without limitation the Parties to this action, their attorneys, representatives, agents, experts and consultants, acting as such, all non-parties providing discovery in this action, and all other interested persons with actual or constructive notice of this ORDER shall adhere to the following terms, or risk contempt:

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Disclosure and discovery activity in this Action are likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public

Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Stipulated Protective Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 13.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal.

2. <u>DEFINITIONS</u>

- 2.1 <u>Action</u>: *In re Insider, Inc. Pixel-VPPA Litigation*, No. 1:22-cv-06529-AT (S.D.N.Y.).
- 2.2 <u>Challenging Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.
- 2.3 "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), including without limitation: (a) information prohibited from disclosure by statute; (b) information that reveals trade secrets; (c) research, technical, commercial, financial, or other proprietary information that the party has maintained as confidential; (d) medical information concerning any individual; (e) personal identity information; (f) income tax returns (including attached schedules and forms), W-2 forms and 1099 forms; or (g) personnel or employment records of a person who is not a party to the case.
- 2.4 <u>Counsel (without qualifier)</u>: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as each of their support staff).
- 2.5 <u>Designating Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.6 <u>Disclosure or Discovery Material</u>: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other

things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter, or information derived directly therefrom.

- 2.7 <u>Expert</u>: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.
- 2.8 "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: extremely sensitive "Confidential Information or Items" such as trade secret information or computer code and associated comments and revision histories, formulas, engineering specifications, or schematics that define or otherwise describe in detail the algorithms or structure of software or hardware designs, disclosure of which to another Party or Non-Party would create a substantial risk of serious harm that could not be avoided by less restrictive means.
- 2.9 <u>House Counsel</u>: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.
- 2.10 <u>Non-Party</u>: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or other legal entity not named as a Party to this Action.
- 2.11 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party.
- 2.12 <u>Party</u>: any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).
- 2.13 <u>Producing Party</u>: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this Action.
- 2.14 <u>Professional Vendors</u>: persons or entities that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

- 2.15 <u>Protected Material</u>: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or as "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL."
- 2.16 <u>Receiving Party</u>: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulated Protective Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material. However, the protections conferred by this Stipulated Protective Order do not cover the following information: (a) any information that is in the public domain at the time of disclosure to a Receiving Party or becomes part of the public domain after its disclosure to a Receiving Party as a result of publication not involving a violation of this Order, including becoming part of the public record through trial or otherwise; and (b) any information known to the Receiving Party prior to the disclosure or obtained by the Receiving Party after the disclosure from a source who obtained the information lawfully and under no obligation of confidentiality to the Designating Party. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by a separate agreement or order.

4. DURATION

Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Stipulated Protective Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Stipulated Protective Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. Where practicable, the Designating Party should designate for protection only those parts of material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that qualify – so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber or retard the case development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the mistaken designation.

5.2 <u>Manner and Timing of Designations</u>. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see, e.g.*, second paragraph of Section 5.2(a) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

(a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins). Where marking every page of a document is not reasonably practicable, such as with certain native file documents, the Producing Party may designate material as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" by informing the

person to whom the material is provided, in writing in a clear and conspicuous manner at the time of production of such material, that such material is "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL."

A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents or materials available for inspection need not designate them for protection until after the inspecting Party has indicated which material it would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before the designation, all of the material made available for inspection shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix the appropriate legend ("CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL") to each page that contains Protected Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate markings in the margins).

- (b) for testimony given in deposition or in other pretrial or trial proceedings, that the Designating Party identify on the record at the time the testimony is given or by sending written notice of how portions of the transcript of the testimony is designated within thirty (30) days of receipt of the transcript of the testimony. If no indication on the record is made, all information disclosed during a deposition shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL" until the time within which it may be appropriately designated as provided for herein has passed. Parties shall give the other parties notice if they reasonably expect a deposition, hearing or other proceeding to include Protected Material so that the other parties can ensure that only authorized individuals who (if required) have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A) are present at those proceedings.
- (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information or item is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the

information or item warrant protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

5.3 <u>Inadvertent Failures to Designate</u>. If corrected within a reasonable time following discovery thereof, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

6. <u>CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS</u>

- 6.1 <u>Timing of Challenges</u>. Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time. Unless a prompt challenge to a Designating Party's confidentiality designation is necessary to avoid foreseeable, substantial unfairness, unnecessary economic burdens, or a significant disruption or delay of the litigation, a Party does not waive its right to challenge a confidentiality designation by electing not to mount a challenge promptly after the original designation is disclosed.
- 6.2 Meet and Confer. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process by providing written notice of each designation it is challenging (by Bates number) and describing the basis for each challenge. To avoid ambiguity as to whether a challenge has been made, the written notice must recite that the challenge to confidentiality is being made in accordance with this specific paragraph of the Protective Order. The parties shall attempt to resolve each challenge in good faith and must begin the process by conferring directly (in voice to voice dialogue; other forms of communication are not sufficient) within 14 days of the date of service of notice unless the parties agree to a longer period. In conferring, the Challenging Party must explain the basis for its belief that the confidentiality designation was not proper and must give the Designating Party an opportunity to review the designated material, to reconsider the circumstances, and, if no change in designation is offered, to explain the basis for the chosen designation. A Challenging Party may proceed to the next stage of the challenge process only if

it has engaged in this meet and confer process first or establishes that the Designating Party is unwilling to participate in the meet and confer process in a timely manner.

6.3 <u>Judicial Intervention</u>. If the Parties cannot resolve a challenge without court intervention, the parties shall follow the Court's Individual Practices in Civil Cases. Specifically, as set forth in Section II.C of such practices, the Parties shall file a joint letter brief, not to exceed six pages. Such letter should be submitted within 14 days of the parties agreeing that the meet and confer process will not resolve their dispute.

The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived the confidentiality designation by failing to file a letter brief to retain confidentiality as described above, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the court rules on the challenge.

7. <u>ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

7.1 <u>Basic Principles.</u> A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this case only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this litigation. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the litigation has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section 14 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).

Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

7.2 <u>Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;
- (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A);
- (c) Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A);
 - (d) the court and its personnel;
 - (e) court reporters and their staff;
- (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A);
- (g) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order;
- (h) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions; and
- (i) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.
- 7.3 <u>Disclosure of "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items</u>. Unless otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" only to:
- (a) the Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this litigation;

- (b) Experts of the Receiving Party (1) to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation, and (2) who have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A);
 - (c) the court and its personnel;
 - (d) court reporters and their staff;
- (e) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this litigation and who have signed the "Certification" (Exhibit A);
- (f) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material must be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order;
- (g) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions; and
- (h) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information.

8. SOURCE CODE

- (a) To the extent production of source code becomes necessary in this case, any such source code produced in discovery shall be made available for inspection in a format through which it could be reasonably reviewed and searched during normal business hours or other mutually agreeable times at a mutually agreed upon location. The source code shall be made available for inspection on a secured computer in a secured room without Internet access or network access to other computers, and the Receiving Party shall not copy, remove, or otherwise transfer any portion of the source code onto any recordable media or recordable device. The Producing Party may visually monitor the activities of the Receiving Party's representatives during any source code review, but only to ensure that there is no unauthorized recording, copying, or transmission of the source code.
- (b) The Receiving Party may request paper copies of limited portions of source code that are reasonably necessary for the preparation of court filings, pleadings, expert reports, or

other papers, or for deposition or trial, but shall not request paper copies for the purposes of reviewing the source code other than electronically as set forth in paragraph (c) in the first instance. The Producing Party shall provide all such source code in paper form including bates numbers and the label "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." The Producing Party may challenge the amount of source code requested in hard copy form pursuant to the dispute resolution procedure and timeframes set forth in Paragraph 6 whereby the Producing Party is the "Challenging Party" and the Receiving Party is the "Designating Party" for purposes of dispute resolution.

(c) The Receiving Party shall maintain a record of any individual who has inspected any portion of the source code in electronic or paper form. The Receiving Party shall maintain all paper copies of any printed portions of the source code in a secured, locked area. The Receiving Party shall not create any electronic or other images of the paper copies and shall not convert any of the information contained in the paper copies into any electronic format. The Receiving Party shall only make additional paper copies if such additional copies are (1) necessary to prepare court filings, pleadings, or other papers (including a testifying expert's expert report), (2) necessary for deposition, or (3) otherwise necessary for the preparation of its case. Any paper copies used during a deposition shall be retrieved by the Producing Party at the end of each day and must not be given to or left with a court reporter or any other unauthorized individual.

9. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER <u>LITIGATION</u>

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

- (a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
- (b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to

this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material – and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

10. <u>A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN</u> THIS LITIGATION

- (a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL" or "HIGHLY CONFIDENTIAL." Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.
- (b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's confidential information, then the Party shall:
- (1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

- (2) promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated Protective Order in this litigation, the relevant discovery request(s), and a reasonably specific description of the information requested; and
- (3) make the information requested available for inspection by the Non-Party.
- (c) If the Non-Party fails to object or seek a protective order from this court within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its Protected Material.

11. <u>UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL</u>

If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such person or persons to execute the "Certification" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A. Unauthorized or inadvertent disclosure does not change the status of Discovery Material or waive the right to hold the disclosed document or information as Protected. Any disputes relating to such disclosures are subject to the Standing Order.

12. <u>INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE PROTECTED</u> <u>MATERIAL</u>

When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B).

The parties have agreed upon a process pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(b)(5) and reserve rights to assert privilege as follows:

- (a) If a producing party has a good faith belief that privileged or otherwise protected or confidential data has been inadvertently produced, it shall promptly notify the requesting parties of the claim of privilege, protection or confidentiality;
- (b) Upon receipt of any notice claiming privilege, protection or confidentiality with respect to a produced data, all other parties (regardless of whether they agree with the producing party's claim of privilege, protection or confidentiality) shall promptly:
 - (1) Use reasonable efforts to destroy or sequester all copies of the inadvertently produced data or material in such party's possession, custody, or control, and notify the producing party that they have done so; and
 - (2) Notify the producing party that they have taken reasonable steps to retrieve and destroy or sequester the inadvertently produced data or material from other persons, if any, to whom such documents or material have been provided, consistent with Rule 26(b)(5)(B);
- (c) To the extent a requesting party disputes the producing party's claim of privilege, protection or confidentiality, the receiving party shall notify the producing party of its position within 14 days of receiving the producing party's notice of the dispute. Within 14 days of receiving notification of the dispute, the parties shall meet and confer in an effort to resolve their disagreement. If the parties are unable to resolve their disagreement, the parties may submit the issue to the Court for a determination and may submit any document(s) in dispute under seal in compliance with Rule 26(b)(5)(B).

(3) Communications involving trial counsel that post-date the filing of the complaint need not be placed on a privilege log, so long as the communication was not shared with anyone other than counsel and client or counsel and work product consultants or work product consultants acting pursuant to their engagement by trial counsel and clients. Communications may be identified on a privilege log by category, rather than individually, if appropriate.

13. MISCELLANEOUS

- 13.1 <u>Right to Further Relief.</u> Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the court in the future.
- 13.2 <u>Right to Assert Other Objections</u>. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.
- 13.3 <u>Filing Protected Material</u>. A Party may not file in the public record in this Action any Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with the Court's Individual Practices, including Section IV.

14. <u>FINAL DISPOSITION</u>

Within 60 days after the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled

to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4 (DURATION).

STIPULATED TO:

By: /s/ Kimberly Macey

Christian Levis

Amanda Grace Fiorilla

LOWEY DANNENBERG P.C.

44 South Broadway, Suite 1100

White Plains, NY 10601

914-997-0500

Fax: 914-997-0035

Email: clevis@lowey.com

EMAIL: afiorilla@lowey.com

Adam E. Polk (SBN 273000)

Simon Grille (SBN 294914)

Jessica R. Cook (SBN 339009)

Kimberly Macey (SBN 342019)

GIRARD SHARP LLP

601 California Street, Suite 1400

San Francisco, CA 94108

Telephone: (415) 981-4800

apolk@girardsharp.com

sgrille@girardsharp.com

jcook@girardsharp.com

kmacey@girardsharp.com

Attorneys for Plaintiffs

By: /s/ Jeffrey Landis

Jeffrey Landis

Dana Brusca

ZWILLGEN PLLC

1900 M Street Nw

Suite 250

Washington, DC 20036

(202)-296-3585

Fax: (202)-706-5298

Email: jeff@zwillgen.com

Email: dana@zwillgen.com

Sheri B. Pan

ZWILLGEN PLLC

183 Madison Ave

Ste #1504

New York, NY 10166

646-362-5590

Email: sheri@zwillgen.com

Attorneys for Defendant

SO ORDERED.

Date: February 3, 2023

New York, New York

Hon. Analisa Torres

United States District Judge

16